

**Constructing the World**  
**Lecture 6: Whither the Aufbau?**

**David Chalmers**

**Text:** <http://consc.net/oxford/>.

**E-mail:** [chalmers@anu.edu.au](mailto:chalmers@anu.edu.au).

**General discussion meeting:** Thursday 11-1, Ryle Room.

Background

S is (a priori) **scrutable** from C iff it is knowable a priori that if the sentences in C obtain, then S obtains.

So far, I have argued that all truths are scrutable from PQTI (microphysical truths, phenomenal truths, that's-all sentence, indexical truths); and from a stripped-down base involving indexicals, logic/math, fundamentality, plus some/all of spatiotemporal, nomic, phenomenal, and quiddistic expressions.

---

**Definitional Scrutability:** All truths logically entailed by base truths and definitions.

**Analytic Scrutability:** All truths analytically entailed by base truths.

**Primitive Scrutability:** All truths a priori (analytically?) scrutable from truths involving primitive concepts.

---

An expression is **Twin-earthable** if it is possible for someone to use it nondeferentially with one extension and for a twin to use a corresponding term with a different extension. An expression is **narrow** if it is non-Twin-earthable or a primitive indexical. [N.B. extensions of predicates and general terms are properties.]

**Narrow Scrutability:** All truths are a priori scrutable from narrow truths (those using only narrow expressions).

**Narrowness of Scrutability:** If sentence A is scrutable from set B for a speaker S, and A and B have counterparts A' and B' for a twin speaker S', then A' is scrutable from B.

**Narrowness of Apriority:** If a thought T constitutes a priori knowledge, and T has a counterpart T' in a twin, then T' constitutes a priori knowledge.

---

An **epistemically rigid** expression is one that has the same extension in every epistemically possible scenario (and every possible world). Alternative: one whose extension can be known a priori.

An **acquaintance** expression is epistemically rigid or a primitive indexical.

**Acquaintance Scrutability:** All truths are scrutable from truths involving only acquaintance expressions.

**Fundamental Scrutability:** All truths are scrutable from metaphysically fundamental truths plus indexical truths.

Fundamental truths: must be epistemically rigid and necessitate all (epistemically rigid) truths.

**Argument for Fundamental Scrutability:**

1. All epistemically rigid truths are necessitated by (epistemically rigid) fundamental truths.
  2. When S is epistemically rigid, S is necessary iff S is a priori.
  - \_\_\_\_\_
  3. All epistemically rigid truths are a priori scrutable from fundamental truths.
  4. All truths are a priori scrutable from epistemically rigid truths and indexical truths.
  - \_\_\_\_\_
  5. All truths are a priori scrutable from fundamental truths and indexical truths.
- 

**Structural Scrutability:** All truths are scrutable from structural truths.

Strongly structural truths: logical expressions alone.

Weakly structural truths: logical expressions and (objective?) relation expressions.

**Spatiotemporal Structuralism:** All truths scrutable from spatiotemporal truths (plus indexical truths, and allowing logical/mathematical expressions).

**Nomic Structuralism:** All truths scrutable from nomic truths (plus...).

**Phenomenal Structuralism:** All truths scrutable from (structural) phenomenal truths (plus...).

**Fundamentality Structuralism:** All truths scrutable from truths about fundamentality (plus...)

---

The Carnap/Lewis *Aufbau*: The base contains logical, mathematical, and indexical expressions, plus 'fundamental'.

My *Aufbau*: The base contains logical, mathematical, and indexical expressions, plus phenomenal expressions, 'law', and 'fundamental'.